

DRAFT

**RECOMMENDATIONS FOR PROCESS TO SELECTION AND
RECRUIT
CHIEF EXECUTIVE
FOR
HEREFORDSHIRE COUNCIL

AUGUST 2012**

CONTENTS

Introduction and document status	2
Timeline	3
Role Profile	6
Evaluation and Salary Benchmarking Data	6
Job advertisement	9
Overview of selection process	10
Appendix 1	14

THE ORIGINAL OF THIS DOCUMENT IS HELD BY ROSEMARIE LOFT, HEAD OF HR

INTRODUCTION AND DOCUMENT STATUS

This document is a draft paper to gain approval for the recruitment and selection process for a new Chief Executive for Herefordshire Council. The Employment Panel (i.e. Leader, Deputy Leader, 1 Con backbencher, Cllr Matthews, Cllr Hubbard) agrees the remuneration of the post for recommendation to Council, and approves the process for recruitment & selection of a new Chief Executive; Council confirms the selected appointee in post.

While in draft this document remains confidential to the council members and employees engaged directly in the selection and recruitment process only.

However, once approved and once the selection and recruitment process is completed, participants in the recruitment process should be aware that this document, together with the decisions and notes of all participants *may* be subject to disclosure.

To support the information gathering for possible and appropriate information disclosure, the Head of HR will provide appropriate templates and guidance at different stages of the process.

Decisions and/or recommendations are required in respect of the information supplied on the following pages:

- | | |
|---|--------|
| 1. Approval for the timeline and allocation of responsibilities | p3-5 |
| 2. Approval of role profile | p6 |
| 3. New CE remuneration recommendation | p6-8 |
| 4. CE advertisement | p9 |
| 5. Recruitment and selection process | p10-13 |

TIMELINE

The tables below outline proposed timelines for activities based on alternative options:

1. A two stage recruitment process comprising internal then, if required, external
2. A single stage process comprising both internal and external recruitment

Both timelines comply with the requirements of the council's pay policy statement and constitution.

The council's employment policies make provision for a two stage process which allows for an initial 'internal candidates only' selection procedure; should an appointment not be made at this stage, the process then moves to external recruitment. This provision was brought in to ensure that existing staff were supported to progress internally, particularly during times of significant organisational change.

Using a two stage process is not an absolute requirement and, for a post of this scale and dimension, and taking account of the size of the pool of potential candidates, it may be considered more appropriate to compress the two stages into one enabling the pool of potential candidates to be expanded to the greatest possible number at the earliest stage.

There will be cost implications associated with either option although clearly, should an internal candidate only phase of a two stage process result in a successful appointment, the costs will be significantly less than either a single stage process or a two stage process that does require the second external stage. It is not possible to provide precise costs until the exact number of candidates is known; however it is estimated that the independent external assessment elements of an internal only process would be in the region of £3-5k. The costs of independent external assessment and consultancy support for search and recruitment in a single stage process for a post at this level are estimated at being in the region of £80-90k (although some elements within this overall costing could be scaled down e.g. advertising). Should both phases of a two stage process be required then the costs rise to an estimated £85-95k. Whilst in the current financial climate cost reduction is a significant consideration, members also must be assured that the process they adopt will enable them to appoint the best candidate.

Table 1

Action	Timeline
Proper Officer Appointed	Completed
Employment Panel papers sent out	3 August 2012
Employment Panel agrees remuneration of post for recommendation to Council, and approves process for recruitment	13 August 2012
Internal Advertisement	14 August 2012
Closing date	09:00 24 August 2012
Preparation of Shortlisting Portfolio for panel, including applications, shortlisting criteria, job information, etc	End 24 August 2012
Shortlisting Panel sits (Chair of EP, Proper Officer, HR Advisor, any others?)	Week commencing 27

	August 2012
Selection process, including interview and panel sessions (outline process described pp10-13)	10 or 11 September 2012
Cabinet Members consulted on recommended appointee (or if fail to appoint instruct commencement of external recruitment)	Immediately following interview
Agenda for Council sent out	20 September 2012
Council approve appointment and remuneration of post (or just remuneration confirmation if fail to appoint)	28 September 2012
Closing date	18 October 2012
Longlist	Week commencing 22 October 2012
Shortlist (panel as previously defined)	Week commencing 29 October 2012
Interview (outline process described pp10-13)	Week commencing 5 November 2012
Cabinet Members consulted on recommended appointee	Week commencing 12 November 2012
Agenda for Council sent out	15 November 2012
Council approve appointment	23 November 2012

Table 2

Action	Timeline
Proper Officer Appointed	Completed
Employment Panel papers sent out	3 August 2012
Employment Panel agrees remuneration of post for recommendation to Council, and approves process for recruitment	2.00pm 13 August 2012
Search/Advertisement	Begins 14 August 2012
Closing date	9.00am 13 September 2012
Preparation of Shortlisting Portfolio for panel, including applications, shortlisting criteria, job information, etc	End 14 September 2012
Shortlisting Panel sits (Chair of EP, Proper Officer, HR Advisor, any others?)	17 September 2012
Shortlisted candidates complete independent assessments (e.g. Burnham & Rosen & selection tool)	18-20 September 2012
Agenda for Council approval of remuneration and report on appointment of individual (name to be advised verbally at the meeting) sent out	20 September 2012

Preparation of Selection Portfolio for panel, including applications, selection criteria, job information, summaries of independent assessments etc	21 September 2012
Selection process, including interview and panel sessions (outline process described pp10-13)	24 & 25 September 2012
Cabinet Members consulted on recommended appointee (or failure to appoint and consequently authorise external recruitment)	Immediately following interview
Council approve appointment and remuneration of post	28 September 2012

DECISION REQUIRED:

The employment panel are asked to confirm which of the above two recruitment processes are preferred and to approve the relevant timeline.

ROLE PROFILE

This is attached as Appendix 1.

DECISION REQUIRED:

The Employment Panel are asked to approve the role profile.

EVALUATION AND BENCHMARKING DATA

Evaluation Data

The role profile was submitted to Hay week commencing 23 July 2012 in accordance with the council's job evaluation practice for senior appointments.

Hay subsequently provided an evaluation score of 2028 which is commensurate with a Chief Executive score and in alignment with scores obtained for other senior council officers over a period of time and takes into account the reduction in job size from their previous assessment undertaken in 2008 due to the demise of the PCT, the return of the single focus on council leadership and the main accountabilities that the role now has.

The impact of the evaluation by Hay is shown in their pay benchmarking data in Table 1 below.

Pay Benchmarking Data

Three sets of different data have been obtained in order to review the Chief Executive remuneration level to be set.

These have been obtained from:

1. Hay (Table 1) who currently provide HC evaluations and independent pay information based upon recent public sector/not for profit outside London appointments – restricted to those managed by Hay;
2. W Mids LGA benchmarking data including less recent appointments, and benchmarking data re similar unitary authorities;
3. Sample data obtained from new and more recent appointments (Table 2).

Table 1

Lower Quartile	150,000
Median	158,000
Upper Quartile	177,000

Table 2

Recent CE Appointments	
LG, rural county	145,000
LG, rural city	140,000

Analysis and Summary

1. The average CE pay among local authorities within the West Midlands region (excluding Birmingham) is currently £161,994 inclusive of payments made for the role of Returning Officer. Taking account of additional benchmarking information from similar rural unitary authorities this average reduces to £160,804; it should be taken into account that a number of the existing post holders have over time accrued service pay rises within a pay grade.
2. There is no real consistency in the way that payment is made for RO duties: most appear to now include it in base pay through an evaluation process, although some do separate out and pay on a fee basis.
3. The Hay evaluation of a lower quartile of £150,000 and a median of £158,000 is broadly in alignment with the W Midlands/other unitary data, although it should be noted that Hay's data is not drawn exclusively from local authorities, but includes all public sector and not-for-profit outside of London (so includes large city authorities and national organisations).
4. Hay comments: "clients tend to use the upper quartile to attract the best, median to remain competitive, and lower if there is a known recruitment pool and/ or broader benefits of working for their organisation."
5. From Hay also: "We would certainly suggest some sort of performance-related element within the package, based on the delivery of key corporate outcomes agreed in advance with Members. This recommendation is supported by various Government reviews (eg, Hutton) and the most progressive authorities now pay less than median for base salary (guaranteed annual income) and a variable annual amount based on performance (often non-consolidated), thereby remaining competitive, communicating expectations through reward, and ensuring a return on investment. Council, in approving its Pay Policy Statement in March committed to reviewing the potential for the introduction of a performance element to senior officer's pay; establishing a salary range for the post, rather than the current 'spot' salary, would provide flexibility for progression within the grade to be conditional on achievement of performance targets should such a policy be agreed in the future.
6. Together with other emerging trends (voluntary reductions in salary, spot salary payments for Chief Executives, inclusive salaries with minimal allowances for transparency) suggests that the Employment Panel could consider both a lower guaranteed and inclusive salary which would be in line with recent appointments as identified in Table 2, but make provision for carefully determined and reasonable performance-related elements subject to any amendment of the Pay Policy. Within local government environments this is currently described as an 'at risk' element of pay that is only awarded on achievement of targets, as opposed to a lower base pay with bonus awards.
7. Making provision for an arrangement such as that outlined in (7) above, it would make attracting a candidate into the area easier, should internal recruitment fail, but without the need to review the remuneration package.
8. Taking account of the benchmarking data available and the broader financial context, it is recommended that a salary grade slightly below the benchmarking average be adopted.

DECISION REQUIRED:

The Employment Panel are asked to agree that a salary range of £140,000 to £145,000 (inclusive of all Returning Officer fees) be recommended to Council.

ADVERTISEMENT AND ADVERTISING PROCESS

The following advertisement has been drafted for use should a two stage process be selected and encourages internal candidates to apply, by way of expression of interest accompanied by a detailed career history, focussing on achievements rather than roles and responsibilities. Should a single stage (or external phase of a two stage process) be selected the final two paragraphs will be deleted and the usual link to a recruitment website/contact details for more information will be provided.

Herefordshire has been gaining wide recognition for its pioneering approach to partnership working, from our ground breaking integration between with NHS Herefordshire in 2007, to the creation in 2011 of Hoople, our support services joint venture company. Now, with the changing shape of our partnership with health and an ambitious programme of service reviews, it's a time of real change in Herefordshire. We are looking for real drive to lead our locality-based initiatives which are focussed on improving outcomes for local people

Working closely with our political leadership you will articulate community ambitions as practical changes to the way we work and the way we serve our local community. Building on our achievements to date, you will lead and support creativity and innovation from colleagues; you will encourage our organisation and partners continually to challenge and review quality and performance. Politically astute, you will support clear communication of ideas and objectives between members and officers, and promote collaborative working whilst maintaining clear accountabilities to deliver measurable results. You will also possess that particular blend of skills that will enable you to have a sound grasp of operational detail but never lose sight of the big picture.

If you are interested in learning more about the specific requirements of the role, please download a copy of the role profile [\[insert LINK\]](#),

Expressions of interest, accompanied by a full CV detailing career history and achievements, should be forwarded for the personal attention of RoseMarie Loft, Head of HR (RoseMarie.Loft@hoopleltd.co.uk) by 9.00am Friday 24th August 2012. This advertisement is currently only open to existing employees of Herefordshire Council.

DECISION REQUIRED:

The Employment Panel are asked to approve the advertisement.

SELECTION PROCESS

The key stages in the selection process are shown in the timelines set out earlier in this paper. Further detail on the selection process is provided below.

1. Responding to the advertisement/search

(Internal process)

- a. Applicants will be asked to express an interest in the role by letter and to send in a detailed career history (CV) which focuses on achievements as expressed in the role profile and criteria (below)
- b. Applicants will have the opportunity to have an informal discussion with the current post holder and the Leader.
- c. Following the closing date, the Head of HR will collate the applications into a shortlisting pack, together with a pro forma for recording feedback against the criteria to be assessed at this stage (chart below) as well as capturing general feedback to be offered to candidates.

(External process)

- a. The executive search company will contact potential applicants.
- b. Applicants from search and/or advertisement will be directed to a link to a recruitment website and contact details for more information.
- c. Following the closing date the executive search company, will support the Head of HR in preparing a shortlisting pack, together with a pro forma for recording feedback against the criteria to be assessed at this stage (chart below) as well as capturing general feedback to be offered to candidates

2. Shortlisting

- a. The panel will consider the information presented and record feedback, making a decision on any candidates considered suitable/unsuitable for interview.
- b. The Head of HR will collate the feedback for all candidates and proceed to organise administrative activities to invite candidates and set up interview stage.
- c. Constructive feedback to be offered to unsuccessful candidates.

3. Additional selection activities

- a. Internal candidates have undergone a Burnham Rosen development process which made recommendations for personal development activity. These profiles may be made available in order to develop specific questions for candidates on their self-awareness of development, identifying strengths and potential weaknesses. External candidates will ne required to complete the Burnham & Rosen assessment if they have not already done so
- b. The development profiles are not linked to the role of Chief Executive and not designed for comparison across candidates (from a technical point of view should not therefore be used on their own to inform selection decisions). A valuable additional profile may be composed for each candidate which would required approximately 40 minutes of their time to complete (either on-line or on paper). This profile will be prepared, specifically related to the areas identified in the role profile (and as illustrated in the chart below) and form part of the interviewers' information packs.
- c. External Chief Executive informal interview; this would be conducted prior to the interview and feedback provided to the panel ahead of the formal interview process.

4. Stakeholder panels

- a. Three possible groups of stakeholders have been identified: members; partners; staff.
- b. Separate stakeholder sessions can be incorporated into the final interview day (morning session) (or across the previous afternoon if time constraints require), each lasting 45 minutes with 15 minutes in between to capture notes. Each session may run concurrently to cater for multiple candidates.
- c. Stakeholder sessions to be briefed with a specific set of attributes and/or skills to assess; structured and facilitated.
- d. Feedback from sessions to be given to Interview Panel prior to interview by each session's facilitator.
- e. Composition of each panel to be agreed; recommend between 4-6 participants in each.

Suggested stakeholder groups (NB there may need to be more than 1 panel within each stakeholder group subject to numbers available on the day):

1. Partners: Herefordshire Partnership Executive Group, Health & Wellbeing Board, NHS Cluster (Jo Newton?), Business Board (Neil Kerr?), Visit Herefordshire (Ben Gill?), Hereford Futures (Ted Wilmott?), Hoople (June French?).
2. Members: Chairman/Vice Chairman of Council; Chairman/Vice Chairmen of OSC, Chairs of planning, Audit & Regulatory Committees, Cabinet Members not on the panel
3. Employees – to include senior managers at Director/Assistant Director level who are not themselves candidates

5. Informal meetings

- a. Lord Lieutenant (Lady Darnley)
- b. Trade Union representative (David Stephens)
- c. All members not included in the panel or a stakeholder group to meet the candidates during lunch

6. Interview Panel

- a. If the panel would prefer candidates to prepare a presentation for the session, it is advised that the question is relevant to one of the role profile criteria (eg explores organisational strategy) so that it informs the final decision.
- b. The interview panel will have the opportunity to receive feedback from the stakeholder panel facilitators prior to conducting the interviews.
- c. The personal profiles, development profiles, career history, facilitator feedback (as above) and interview assessment will all inform the decision.
- d. The Head of HR will provide pro formas for stakeholder and interview panels for recording information and outcomes, with approval from Interview Panel Chair.

7. Feedback to candidates

- a. The Head of HR is prepared to give feedback to any unsuccessful candidates at the shortlisting stage, unless the Chair of the Panel would like to do so personally.
- b. The Chair of the Interview Panel is advised to provide personal feedback to any candidates who are unsuccessful at the final interview stage.

Suggested assessment methods against criteria published in role profile.

	Criteria from Role Profile	Assessment Method
1	Substantial record of senior strategic leadership achievement and experience, consistently developing strategies and translating them into effective operational plans.	Career history (CV) Interview
2	Extensive experience of working effectively and impartially with elected members and in supporting the democratic decision making process.	Members' panel Career history (CV)
3	A broad knowledge of public sector service delivery, both directly and through commissioning.	Interview
4	A successful track record of forging and maintaining working partnerships with communities to ensure the development, design and delivery of services that reflects their needs.	Career history (CV)
5	Able to communicate a compelling vision to key stakeholders internally and externally to achieve operational outcomes.	Stakeholder panel Staff panel Members' panel
6	Experience of successful management and implementation of complex policy issues, leading organisational and/or cultural change in order to achieve successful outcomes.	Career history (CV)
7	Business acumen from creating a commercial environment where the management of cost and customer satisfaction are both paramount.	Career history (CV) Interview Stakeholder Panel
8	A collaborator who can develop relationships with senior stakeholders and politicians to generate a return for the organisation and its customers.	Personality Profile BR Profile Interview Stakeholder Panel
9	A leader who engages and enables others to deliver their best.	Personality Profile Staff Panel
10	Literate in information and communications and digital technologies.	Not to be assessed?
11	An unquestionable record of delivering results through others.	Interview
12	An excellent professional and developmental record that is business management focused.	Career history (CV)
13	Customer Focus: a champion of customer's needs and constantly challenging myself and others to think from a customer perspective	Personality profile Stakeholder panel
14	Communities First: ability to understand the	Members' panel

	needs of the local communities and influence others in way that will appeal to them specifically to achieved desired local outcomes	Stakeholder panel Staff panel
15	Streamlining the Business: ability to redefine the way we do business by positively challenging the way we do things to improve efficiency and remove duplication	Interview Personality profile
16	Better Services: ability to work with partners and develop markets to drive the delivery over the long-term of innovative and new approaches to improve the quality of life of residents of Herefordshire	Stakeholder panel Members' panel Interview
17	People and Performance: ability to create an organisation where people are empowered and committed to delivering the council vision, supported by effective systems, proactive performance management and development	Personality Profile (leadership style) Interview
18	Adverse Indicators: "Territorial"; Closed to new ideas;Accepting of mediocrity	Personality Profile Interview BR Profile
19	Leadership Style/Motivation/Resilience	Personality Profile BR Profile Interview

**HEREFORDSHIRE COUNCIL
ROLE PROFILE: CHIEF EXECUTIVE**

ROLE PURPOSE:

To provide strategic leadership to the organization ensuring that the policy objectives and priorities of the administration are put into operation by the council as efficiently, effectively and economically as possible; through leadership and development of strategic partnerships across Herefordshire and beyond, to ensure the development of shared commitment and capacity to provide high quality public services to people living and working in, or visiting, Herefordshire.

ACCOUNTABILITIES

1. Support Members by providing the highest quality advice and guidance on all relevant matters relating to the council's functions and services. Ensure that members are appraised about issues to enable informed decision making in line with the council's vision and ensuring high standards of internal governance so that policies are agreed and implemented.
2. Working with the Leader of the Council develop an effective collaborative working relationship between the organisational and political structures of the Council and provide an appropriate framework to act as a focal point for Member and management input on policy issues
3. Working with the Leader of the Council and elected members, lead the development of strategies to deliver the policies set by elected councillors, ensuring all staff understand and act on the aims of the organisation, in order to improve the health and wellbeing of the people of Herefordshire.
4. Take lead responsibility for the overall corporate and operational management of the council, monitoring performance against plans to ensure effective and efficient delivery of services to the highest standards, including financial, performance, risk, people and change management. This includes performing the statutory role of Head of Paid Service.
5. Provide an inspiring and dynamic approach to enable the opportunities brought about by the continuing process of change to be identified and managed and the new challenges to be met through creative and innovative solutions.
6. Develop and review the organisation of resources, partnership arrangements and practices to ensure effective and efficient delivery of services.
7. Provide strong, visible leadership and direction through compelling communication of the vision and values of the organisation. Effective delegation to the council's senior team enabling them to empower others to achieve results.
8. Create and manage effective partnerships with a broad range of stakeholders, building support among them in order to deliver better public services and improved results for local people.
9. Represent the organisation, its aims and achievements to stakeholders locally, regionally and nationally.
10. Forge a broad network of contacts across the public and private sector to maintain awareness of best practices and initiatives, adapting them for use within the council to create demonstrable efficiencies and cost savings.
11. Manage relationships with partnerships and providers ensuring that services designed and shaped by commissioners are effectively planned and put into operation.
12. Effectively respond to challenges and identify opportunities for service improvement, redesign and development regarding the alignment of services with community and customer expectations. Seek greater synergies and alignment between county wide (Place) and local initiatives through service delivery models that reflect the composition of Herefordshire's localities and the relative strengths of service providers.
13. Provide first class inspirational leadership to the council by creating the working environment where employees can deliver their best. Pro-actively manage the culture & values of council by being a respected role model and leader. Set and manage ambitious performance expectations for everyone recognising excellence and challenging those who under-perform or seek to threaten new ways of working. Create an environment where learning, innovation and the application of new ideas flourish resulting in significant improvements to service delivery.

SKILLS, KNOWLEDGE & EXPERIENCE

- Substantial record of senior strategic leadership achievement and experience, consistently developing strategies and translating them into effective operational plans.
- Extensive experience of working effectively and impartially with elected members and in supporting the democratic decision making process.
- A broad knowledge of public sector service delivery, both directly and through commissioning.
- A successful track record of forging and maintaining working partnerships with communities to ensure the development, design and delivery of services that reflects their needs.
- Able to communicate a compelling vision to key stakeholders internally and externally to achieve operational outcomes.
- Experience of successful management and implementation of complex policy issues, leading organisational and/or cultural change in order to achieve successful outcomes.
- Business acumen from creating a commercial environment where the management of cost and customer satisfaction are both paramount.
- A collaborator who can develop relationships with senior stakeholders and politicians to generate a return for the organisation and its customers.
- A leader who engages and enables others to deliver their best.
- Literate in information and communications and digital technologies.
- An unquestionable record of delivering results through others.
- An excellent professional and developmental record that is business management focused.

PERFORMANCE MEASURES

Employees and culture

- Employee engagement
- Working climate
- Innovation application
- Behaviour

Relationships

- Reputation
- Policy influence
- Member feedback
- Partner feedback

PERFORMANCE MEASURES

Customer Service

- Peer and Member feedback
- Continuous improvement in levels of customer satisfaction/ service quality
- Quality of life in Herefordshire

Value for Money

- Service delivery & improvement
- Continuous cost reduction
- Achievement of key performance indicators (KPI's)

LEADERSHIP BEHAVIOURS

Customer Focus: I always champion customer's needs and constantly challenging myself and others to think from a customer perspective

Communities First: I understand the needs of the local communities and influence others in way that will appeal to them specifically to achieved desired local outcomes

Streamlining the Business: I redefine the way we do business by positively challenging the way we do things to improve efficiency & remove duplication

Better Services: I work with partners & develop markets to drive the delivery over the long-term of innovative & new approaches to improve the quality of life of residents of Herefordshire

People and Performance: I create an organisation where people are empowered & committed to delivering the council vision, supported by effective systems, proactive performance management & development

I am not:
Territorial
Closed to new ideas
Accepting of mediocrity

DIMENSIONS

Employees

Accountable for approx 1350 employees (staffing budget approx £35m)

Direct reports 3:

Director of Corporate Services (Deputy Chief Executive)

Director for People's Services

Director for Places & Communities

Managerial Accountability for:

Director for Public Health

Budget:

2012/13 Net Revenue

- £ 143.359m

2012/13 Capital Programme

- £46m

Accountable to:

Leader of the Council/Executive of the Council

Political Restriction:

The post is designated politically restricted (under S2 Local Government and Housing Act 1989, as amended)

STATUTORY DUTIES

- The postholder fulfils the statutory functions of Head of Paid Service
- The postholder is the council's designated Proper Officer for all statutory 'proper officer' functions
- The postholder fulfils the functions of Electoral Registration Officer and Returning Officer/Acting Returning Officer (these functions are fulfilled independently of the Council)
- The postholder fulfils the functions of Clerk to the Lieutenancy
- This post has been identified as a group number 8 safeguarding post (as defined in the 'Working Together Guidance').